

Appendix to Hanley and McNeil Radiology paper "A Method of Comparing the Areas under ROC curves derived from same cases."

PS (JH 2002.09.17): This was a first (? rough) step in the early 1980's. The method of DeLong ER, DeLong DM, Clarke-Pearson DL *Comparing the areas under two or more correlated receiver operating characteristic curves: a nonparametric approach. Biometrics. 1988 Sep;44(3):837-45* is more elegant and less parametric. They implemented it using a SAS macro. The paper by Hanley JA, Hajian-Tilaki KO. *Sampling variability of nonparametric estimates of the areas under receiver operating characteristic curves: an update. Acad Radiol. 1997 Jan;4(1):49-58* shows how to implement the DeLong et al. method by spreadsheet (or by a simple SAS program available on the website <http://www.epi.mcgill.ca/hanley/>)

Appendix

Calculation of r

Let \hat{A}_x and \hat{A}_y represent estimates of the ROC areas A_x and A_y . Then the correlation r between \hat{A}_x and \hat{A}_y can be expressed as

$$r = \frac{\text{Cov}(\hat{A}_x, \hat{A}_y)}{\text{SE}(\hat{A}_x)\text{SE}(\hat{A}_y)} \quad (1)$$

Calculation of Denominator in (1)

From our first paper (4), the variance, or square of the standard error, is given by

$$\text{Var}(\hat{A}) = \frac{\text{Area}(1 - \text{Area}) + (n - 1)(Q_1 + Q_2 - 2 \text{Area}^2)}{n^2}$$

where

n = number of abnormal (= number of normals, for simplification)

Q_1 = probability that a randomly chosen abnormal will appear more abnormal than each of two randomly chosen normals

Q_2 = probability that two randomly chosen abnormal will each appear more abnormal than one randomly chosen normal

The area of the quantities Q_1 and Q_2 can be thought of as follows: let the "degree of abnormality" of a randomly chosen abnormal be represented by

x_A , with mean μ_A and variance σ_A^2 . Similarly, let the degree of abnormality for a randomly chosen normal be X_N , with mean μ_N and variance σ_N^2 . Then the area is the probability that an X_A and an X_N will be correctly ranked i.e.

$$\text{Area} = \text{Prob}(X_A > X_N) = \text{Prob}(X_A - X_N > 0)$$

which is simply the probability that an observation $V = X_A - X_N$ which follows a distribution with mean $\mu_A - \mu_N$ and variance $\sigma_A^2 + \sigma_N^2$ will have a value greater than zero. If X_A and X_N are taken to be Gaussian, then the area equals the proportion of the standardized normal distribution to the left of $(\mu_A - \mu_N)/\sqrt{\sigma_A^2 + \sigma_N^2}$.

In order to translate Q_1 and Q_2 into numerical terms, let X_{A1} , X_{A2} , X_{N1} , X_{N2} represent the values for two randomly chosen abnormal and two randomly chosen normals respectively, and again assume that X_A 's and X_N 's follow overlapping Gaussian distributions.

Then

$$Q_1 = \text{Probability } (X_{A1} > X_{N1} \text{ and } X_{A1} > X_{N2}) ,$$

which can be calculated instead as

$$Q_1 = \text{Prob}(X_{A1} - X_{N1} > 0 \text{ and } X_{A1} - X_{N2} > 0) .$$

If we define two new variables

$$V_1 = X_{A1} - X_{N1} \text{ and } V_2 = X_{A1} - X_{N2} ,$$

Q_1 becomes the probability mass in the right upper quadrant of the bivariate (V_1, V_2) Gaussian distribution with means

3

$$\mu_{V_1} = \mu_A - \mu_N \quad \mu_{V_2} = \mu_A - \mu_N ,$$

variances

$$\sigma_{V_1}^2 = \sigma_A^2 + \sigma_N^2 \quad \sigma_{V_2}^2 = \sigma_A^2 + \sigma_N^2 ,$$

and covariance

$$\text{Cov}(V_1, V_2) = \sigma_A^2 .$$

This quantity Q_1 can be obtained for various values of σ_A^2 , σ_N^2 and Area by IMSL subroutine MDBNOR (9) or other equivalent programs. The quantity Q_2 is obtained in a similar way, being the probability in the right upper quadrant of a bivariate Gaussian distribution with the same means and variances but with covariance σ_N^2 .

Calculation of Numerator in (1)

To do this, we express each area estimate in its equivalent Wilcoxon-statistic formulation.

$$\text{Area}_x = \sum_k \sum_l^{(x)} S_{ij} / n^2$$

$$\text{Area}_y = \sum_k \sum_l^{(y)} S_{kl} / n^2$$

where

$$S_{ij}^{(x)} = \begin{cases} 1 & \text{if the } i^{\text{th}} \text{ chosen abnormal is regarded as more abnormal} \\ & \text{than the } j^{\text{th}} \text{ chosen normal, when both are imaged with} \\ & \text{modality } x, 0 \text{ if the ranking is reversed.} \end{cases} \quad 4$$

$$S_{kl}^{(y)} = 1 \text{ or } 0, \text{ according to a similar rule, for the pair of images} \\ \text{obtained with modality } y.$$

Then using E as expected value or long run average over many samples,

$$\text{Cov}(\text{Ar}\hat{e}a_x, \text{Ar}\hat{e}a_y) = E(\text{Ar}\hat{e}a_x \text{Ar}\hat{e}a_y) - E(\text{Ar}\hat{e}a_x)E(\text{Ar}\hat{e}a_y)$$

$$= \frac{1}{n^4} \sum_i \sum_j \sum_k \sum_l E(S_{ij}^{(x)} S_{kl}^{(y)}) - \text{Area}_x \text{Area}_y,$$

$$= \frac{1}{n^4} [n^2 Q_3 + n(n^2 - n)Q_4 + n(n^2 - n)Q_5 + (n^2 - n)(n^2 - n)\text{Area}_x \text{Area}_y] \\ - \text{Area}_x \text{Area}_y,$$

where

Q_3 = Probability that a randomly chosen abnormal will be regarded as more abnormal than a randomly selected normal, when each of the two subjects is imaged with each of the two modalities.

Q_4 = Probability that a randomly chosen abnormal will be regarded as more abnormal than a randomly chosen normal when using modality x , and that with modality y a second randomly chosen abnormal will be ranked more abnormal than the same randomly chosen normal.

Q_5 = The reverse of Q_4 , i.e. with one randomly chosen abnormal and two randomly chosen normals.

The quantities Q_3 to Q_5 are calculated in a manner somewhat similar to that used for Q_1 and Q_2 . As illustration, to calculate Q_4 , let (X_{A_1}, X_{N_1}) represent the degrees of abnormality in a randomly chosen (abnormal, normal) pair of subjects imaged with modality x. Let (Y_{A_2}, Y_{N_1}) represent the degree of abnormality seen when the same normal and a second abnormal are imaged with modality y. Then

$$Q_4 = \text{Prob}(V_1 = X_{A_1} - X_{N_1} > 0 \text{ and } V_2 = Y_{N_2} - Y_{N_1} > 0)$$

Let the X's and Y's have Gaussian distributions as before, let the (X_N, Y_N) pair, corresponding to a single normal imaged by both modalities, have a correlation of ρ_N , and assume that their bivariate distribution is in fact bivariate Gaussian. Similarly, assume that the pair of observations (X_A, Y_A) for a single randomly selected abnormal have a bivariate Gaussian distribution, with correlation coefficient ρ_A . Then Q_4 becomes the probability in the right upper quadrant of the (V_1, V_2) bivariate Gaussian distribution with

$$\begin{aligned} \mu_{V_1} &= \mu_{Ax} - \mu_{Nx} & \mu_{V_2} &= \mu_{Ay} - \mu_{Ny} \\ \sigma_{V_1}^2 &= \sigma_{Ax}^2 + \sigma_{Nx}^2 & \sigma_{V_2}^2 &= \sigma_{Ay}^2 + \sigma_{Ny}^2 \end{aligned}$$

Covariance $(V_1, V_2) = \text{Cov}(X_N, Y_N) = \rho_N \sigma_{Nx} \sigma_{Ny}$ and can be obtained by subroutine MDBNOR.

For Q_3 and Q_5 , the correspondingly defined (V_1, V_2) pairs will have bivariate distributions with obvious means and variances and with

$$\text{Cov}(V_1, V_2) = \rho_A \sigma_{Ax} \sigma_{Ay} + \rho_N \sigma_{Nx} \sigma_{Ny} \quad 6$$

in the case of Q_3 , and

$$\text{Cov}(V_1, V_2) = \rho_N \sigma_{Ax} \sigma_{Ay}$$

in the case of Q_5 .